



SELECTION COMMITTEE MINUTES

Private Industry Council
REACH Room 116 - 2342 N. 27th Street
Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53210

Thursday, September 15, 2005
1:30 P.M.

- In Attendance:** Richard Abelson (Chair), Lyle Balistreri, B.G. Robert Cocroft, Robert Dennik, Enid Glenn, John Hiller, Willie Johnson, Sheila Knox, Vince Martin, Lupe Martinez, Gerard Randall, Jeannetta Robinson, Carol Sample
- Staff Present:** Leo Baber, Alba Baltodano, Delores Graves, Wylbur Holloway, Mark Kessenich, Theresa Palazzari, Patti Porth, Jovo Potkonjak, Tonya Powell, Lamont Williams, Paul Wechter
- Excused:** Dan Davis, Paul Soczynski, Leonila Vega
- Guests:** Tanya Henry (Milw. Career Coop), John Possell (Milw. Career Coop), Hector Lerma (UMOS), Eugene Miller (UMOS), Theresa Loerke (DWD), Dick Buschmann (Milw. Career Coop), Jerry Miksch (UMOS), John Doherty (Transit Express)

MINUTES (Pending Committee Approval)

Mr. Abelson called the meeting to order at 1:37 p.m. with introductions of the Committee.

I. Approval of Minutes

Mr. Abelson called for the question to approve the July 21, 2005 minutes as written.

Motion to approve July 21, 2005 Minutes
Second

Sheila Knox
Lupe Martinez

Motion carried unanimously

II. WETAP - Proposals

The vendor selection process and recommendations were presented to the committee by PIC staffers Delores Graves, Employer Services Manager, and Leo Baber, Wisconsin Employment Transportation Assistance Program (WETAP) Coordinator. Ms. Graves began her presentation explaining that this program funding had not required RFP solicitation since 2002. While the program was undergoing continuous change relative to funding and administrative requirements,

PIC was authorized to continue to operate its transportation program with the same three (3) vendors selected through the 2002 RFP process. The 2005 RFP process was according to PIC approved standards and is summarized below:

- The RFP was released on August 10, 2005 through media publications, and made available to interested parties in hard copy and electronic forms.
- Four proposals were received by the announced deadline - Exact Transport, Transit Express Services, Milwaukee Career Cooperatives (MCC) and Spirit of Angels Transportations.
- The Proposal Review Committee was selected and included internal staff and external representatives from Milwaukee County Transit Systems and Milwaukee County Department of Parks and Public Infrastructure Works.
- On September 2, the review committee received a WETAP overview. Proposals were distributed and scoring sheets were explained. Individuals were requested to submit scores to the Transportation Coordinator on or before September 6, 2005 and the committee reconvened on September 7 to review the combined scores and final ratings. The Review Committee was asked to submit vendor recommendations for the WETAP service components as outlined in the RFP. The recommendations were as follows:
 - Transit Express Services – Brown Deer Shuttle Flexible Service - \$132,000
 - Transit Express Services – Milwaukee Job Center Solution Service - \$20,000
 - Exact Transport – Employer Customized Service - \$230,000

Ms. Graves provided a handout to the committee to explain and further illustrate the committee recommendation of the two vendors that is a change from the current three vendors. Transit Express Services received the highest rating and is our current Flexible Service Vendor. Ms. Graves explained that Exact Transport Services received the 2nd highest rating and Milwaukee Careers Cooperative received the 3rd highest rating. The 2nd and 3rd ranked vendors are current Employer Customized Service vendors. There was a 2.25 point difference between 2nd and 3rd place scores. However, due to a significant 30% decrease in funding received for this service component, the staff determined it would not be cost feasible to continue to operate this service with two vendors. After reviewing the service needs with the review committee, it was recommended to select one vendor for the Employer Customized component. Upon further review of information submitted in the proposals, the committee agreed to recommend Exact Transport, whose business purpose is identified and operates as a transportation company, versus Milwaukee Careers Cooperative, that is identified and operates as an employment agency. The staff and their review panel agreed that this recommendation will insure that eligible clients can continue to receive the best possible service and PIC will be able to maintain an efficient program administration.

Chairman Richard Abelson opened the floor for questions from committee members after further explaining to the audience the handout Ms. Graves distributed to committee members.

Ms. Sheila Knox stated that it is her understanding that MCC was not selected due to limited funding even though they scored well in the review process. She asked if there was any way MCC could be one of the service providers. Ms. Graves responded that staff's assessment of the current service needs and greatly reduced funding made it cost prohibitive to split this

service component. One transportation provider should be able to service the current riders and employers by merging the routes currently serving the five employers' locations in the same geographical area.

Ms. Jeannetta Robinson asked if, for efficiency of services, the committee could vote to allow Exact Transport to subcontract with MCC. Since MCC has proven and already established a positive partnership with the PIC, Ms. Robinson felt a subcontractor would provide assurance that clients would continue to receive efficient service avoiding possible late pick-ups and/or coverage for emergencies with both clients and employers.

Ms. Delores Graves asked if the committee would advise staff as to whether permitting Exact Transport to subcontract after the close of the RFP would affect the process since the RFP did not include such a provision and neither Exact Transport nor MCC included subcontracting in their proposals. Ms. Robinson stated she believed there would be no adverse affect and recommends that Exact Transport should be given the option to subcontract with MCC. Chairman Abelson asked Ms. Robinson to clarify if her recommendation is to "impose" Exact Transport to subcontract and Ms. Robinson stated her recommendation is not to "impose" but to "recommend."

Chairman Abelson inquired if a representative from Exact Transport was present in the audience. No representatives from the company were present and committee members expressed their disappointment. Specific comments regarding their absence were expressed from Ms. Robinson, Mr. Lupe Martinez, Ms. Sheila Knox, Mr. Lyle Balistreri and Ms. Enid Glenn. Other members stated that it should be a requirement that any agency recommended to receive a contract award from the PIC should attend the Selection and Monitoring Committee meeting.

Brig. Gen. Robert Cocroft asked for the exact number of current vendors currently in the WETAP program. Ms. Graves responded there have been three since the last RFP selections in 2002. She further stated that the scoring outcomes from the current RFP would have qualified all three to remain if the funding that was requested had been approved and granted by the State. Further questions from Ms. Knox regarding dividing the funding between the three resulted in Ms. Graves again indicating the staff and panel reviewed the level of service requirements and determined it could not be done effectively.

Chairman Abelson asked PIC legal counsel to comment on the subcontracting matter. Paul Wechter indicated that the PIC could not force subcontracting, that the RFP guidelines were followed correctly, and the responses did not indicate subcontracting. As with all PIC subcontracts, any subcontracts would have to be reviewed and approved by the PIC. He further advised that the Board should be very hesitant to put pressure on any vendor to subcontract.

Supervisor Willie Johnson indicated that his review of the scoring indicated a wide variance of the scores among review committee members. Ms. Graves responded that the totals of the scores were very close and that scoring was done individually and discussed collectively when the committee reconvened. No one volunteered, nor was it requested, if anyone felt it necessary to reconsider any score given.

Mr. Vince Martin asked if Exact Transport could subcontract with PIC approval and if the committee would be setting a precedent by stating Exact Transport should subcontract with another company. Ms. Robinson replied that it is this committee and the Board that has the authority.

Chairman Abelson then asked if there was a motion to approve the WETAP contract recommendations.

**Motion to Approve WETAP Proposal
award to Transit Express \$152,000.00
and \$230,000.00 to Exact Transport**

Gerard Randall

Second

None

Motion failed due to lack of a second

**Motion made to grant the contract
Exact Transport for \$230,000.00 and allow
the opportunity to subcontract with MCC**

Jeannetta Robinson

Second

Vince Martin

Mr. Lyle Balistreri then indicated that Exact Transport would have to agree with the motion that was on the table and then Chairman Abelson asked if approval of the motion would give Exact Transport the final decision whether or not to enter into a subcontract agreement with MCC. If so, the deadline for their RFP changes and/or modifications would have to be received for approval by this committee prior to October 1, 2005. Mr. Lupe Martinez wanted the record to reflect that his vote would be to not fund Exact Transport due to their not attending this meeting. Ms. Robinson asked to withdraw her motion to approve Exact Transport with the option for subcontracting with MCC, but the second remained and the motion stayed on the table.

Ms. Graves informed the committee that Exact Transport inquired of the staff whether or not it was a requirement to attend the meeting. PIC staff advised it was not required and attendance was up to Exact Transport. Ms. Graves was concerned that staff may have given Exact Transport an ill-advised response. Mr. Abelson stated businesses should not need to inquire regarding proper business actions such as this.

Mr. Abelson expressed his confidence in staff following correct and approved guidelines in the RFP process and review committees performing their work appropriately. Ms. Knox expressed that committee questions are posed for understanding and clarification because they take their work very seriously. It is not a reflection of lack of confidence or support for the staff's work.

Mr. Vince Martin expressed his concern that Exact Transport not be penalized for their absence since this has not been a requirement for recommended vendors in the past.

Ms. Sheila Knox, Supervisor Willie Johnson, and Ms. Enid Glenn asked to hear from representatives of MCC who were present at the meeting.

Mr. Dick Buschmann, MCC Board Member, and Ms. Tanya Henry, MCC Executive Director, spoke on behalf of MCC. Mr. Buschmann indicated that MCC already had discussions with Exact Transport and that they have a good working relationship. Mr. Buschmann stated MCC

has enjoyed a good performance record in the past relative to the WETAP partnership with PIC and would be willing to accept a subcontract with Exact Transport to continue to provide WETAP service. Ms. Henry stated that she believed the subcontract partnership would occur and that is the basis for her attendance at the meeting.

Motion to close debate on WETAP Proposal

Lyle Balistreri

Second

Gerard Randall

Motion Passed Unanimously

Chairman Abelson then asked that a poll be taken of the committee to approve the WETAP Grants. The poll was taken by the records clerk.

11 – Ayes

Mr. Richard Abelson
Mr. Lyle Balistreri
Brig. Gen. Robert Cocroft
Mr. Robert Dennik
Ms. Enid Glenn
Mr. John Hiller
Supervisor Willie Johnson
Ms. Sheila Knox
Mr. Vince Martin
Mr. Gerard Randall
Ms. Jeannetta Robinson

1 – No

Mr. Lupe Martinez

1-Abstention

Ms. Carol Sample

Motion Passed

III. PY04-05 WIA Adult WIA Case Management

Sue Wile reviewed the contractor performance for program year 04-05. Job Service registered 837 adults and 166 older youth, which was in line with the contractual expectations. The three case management contracts had until June 30th to place individuals into employment and have until September 30th to earn 90-day job retentions. To date, with a combination of the case management contracts and customized trainings, 67% of the placement goal and 52% of the retention goal have been attained.

The report indicates that the budget for customized skills training contracts was underutilized. Ms. Wile explained that the spreadsheet did not reflect costs that were paid out of the current program year, for contracts that began in the prior contract year. Richard Abelson asked that staff provide information regarding the level of this year's budget

utilization and the amount, if any, of funds carried over. Ms. Wile agreed to provide this at the November Selection Committee meeting.

Ms. Wile explained that the WIA adult program “exceeded” three of its four performance measures and “met” the 6 months retention measure. This data is from the second to final run of data for the last program year, from the Department of Workforce Development.

Not an agenda item:

Jeannetta Robinson presented Gerard Randall with a plaque recognizing the Private Industry Council. This award was part of Career Youth Development’s 35th Image Award event. Mr. Randall graciously received the award and thanked Ms. Robinson for her thoughtfulness and commitment to service in the community and with the Private Industry Council.

IV. PY 05-06 Request for Proposals-WIA Case Management

Therese Palazzari reported to the Committee that staff is finalizing the Request for Proposals for WIA case management and for WIA Limited English Proficiency (LEP) case management entities. For the 18 month period starting January 1, 2006 and ending July 30, 2007, \$800,000 is available for WIA case management and \$100,000 for WIA LEP case management. Contracts will be let for the 6 month period of January 2006 through June 30, 2006 and will be extended for an additional year dependent upon performance, WIA reauthorization, and the availability of funding. Technical assistance sessions will be held in late September and the proposals will be due on October 20th. The Selection Committee will be making funding decisions on these proposals at the November meeting.

V. Driver’s License Recovery Information

Wylbur Holloway described to the Committee the various driver’s license recovery programs that exist in the community. The PIC operates a program called Clean Slate that is for youth up to age 21 who seek to resolve citation, warrant and suspension problems. It involves attending some classes and meeting with a Municipal Court Judge.

The Milwaukee Urban League operates a program that works with all ages, having the objective of driver’s license recovery. In addition, an ongoing task force has been meeting to address this issue and involves Making Connections, Milwaukee Area Technical College (MATC), Private Industry Council (PIC), Department of Transportation (DOT), Department of Corrections (DOC), Department of Workforce Development (DWD), Wisconsin Regional Training Partnership (WRTP) and other entities.

VI. Efforts to Document Local Workforce Development Programs

Mark Kessenich briefed the Committee on two local efforts designed to gather information regarding workforce development efforts in Milwaukee County. Making Connections Milwaukee is in the final stages of research on programs within their geographic service area.

They have offered to provide the Committee with a PowerPoint presentation on their results. Mr. Abelson indicated that he would be interested in such a presentation.

The second effort is funded by the Governors' Council on Workforce Development (CWI). They have funded UWM's Center for Workforce Development \$60,000 through December 31, 2005 to identify and survey training and workforce providers in Milwaukee County and to survey organizations regarding collaborations and partnerships.

VII. Other Business

Sheila Knox asked staff to provide some information to the Committee on the possibility of raising the ITA training funds maximum caps for dislocated worker customers. Staff will do so at a future meeting.

Mr. Kessenich discussed efforts that are in progress with the New Orleans evacuees in Milwaukee. The Department of Workforce Development has indicated the Department of Labor may allow the PIC to use National Emergency Grant funds to assist those who are dislocated workers. Sheila Knox indicated that volunteers are needed and welcome at State Fair to help the evacuees. She said that people there have a wide range of skills, from the skilled trades people and other professionals to the completely unskilled. About 250 people are residing at State Fair Park Tommy G. Thompson Residence and another 250 are living in the community and receive superior services at the State Fair Park location. A large variety of organizations have representatives there and a One-Stop Job Resource Center is set up on site.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:30 p.m.